

**Minutes of Technical Evaluation Committee Meeting for Evaluation Technical Bids for Tender No. BMSICL/2023-24/ME-312 held on 24<sup>th</sup> November 2023 at Conference hall of BMSICL Patna,**

1. Attendance- As per the attendance register.
2. In the TEC meeting held on 08/09/2023, it was unanimously decided for the demonstration of the quoted model of equipment by the following technically qualified bidders

Sl. No.	Name of Equipment	Name of Technically Qualified Bidders
1.	Ultrasound Machine (Portable)	M/s Balajee Enterprises
		M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.
		M/s Vikas Medical Devices
2	Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler	M/s Balajee Enterprises
		M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.
		M/s Vikas Medical Devices
3	Computed Radiography (CR System)	M/s Fujifilm India Pvt. Ltd.
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.

3. Accordingly, the demonstration of the above said equipment was held on 17/10/2023, 18/10/2023 & 19/10/2023 as per the schedule. The technically qualified firms demonstrated their quoted model of equipment in presence of committee consisting of experts from PMCH Patna, NMCH Patna, IGIMS Patna & BMSICL Patna.
4. During the demonstration the demonstration team found that as demonstrated model of Ultrasound Machine (Portable) and Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd meets all the specification as per tender but the model name was stickered on the back of the machine, due to which confirmation required on the model quoted by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd

After the demonstration, the firm namely M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd. and M/s Balajee Enterprises submitted the representation regarding quoted model of Ultrasound Machine (Portable) by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd. In context to this intimation

was sent vide BMSICL Letter No- 7159 dt-17/11/2023 to the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd to stand their grounds on the above said representations.

5. In context to BMSICL Letter No- 7159 dt-17/11/2023 the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd clarifies the following through email dt- 19/11/2023.

SI No	Queries by the demonstration team	Factual Status	Remarks
1	Model name was stickered on the back of the Ultrasound Machine (Portable) and Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler as demonstrated by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd. Due to which model quoted was not confirmed.	1) Manufacturer Declaration submitted by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd in which the manufacture M/s Zoncare declared that the Ultrasound Machine (Portable) Model –M5 and Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler (Model –M7) was demonstrated during the demonstration held on 18/10/2023 by our representative. ii) The firm states that every company on their products have a general sticker pasted behind the machine. However, if we are favoured with the order, the said machines shall be delivered with M5 and N7 model names clearly be visible on the screen when you start the machine.	Model of equipment confirmed as per the declaration of the manufacture firm M/s Zoncare for the equipment Ultrasound Machine (Portable) Model –M5 and Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler (Model –M7) submitted by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.
SI No	Representation of the firm M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd. and M/s Balajee Enterprises	Factual Status	Remarks
1	M/s Hemant Surgical who have bid Wuhan Zoncare model M5 against portable ultrasound in the tender was demonstrating different model and hiding fact.  It was obvious that the machine being demonstrated was a different model, the M30. The machine appearance and feature has been capture in official videography.	Manufacturer Declaration submitted by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd in which the manufacture M/s Zoncare declared that the Ultrasound Machine (Portable) Model –M5 was demonstrated during the demonstration held on 18/10/2023 by our representative.	<b>Objection not valid due to following reasons:-</b> (i) The firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd submitted the manufacturer (M/s Zoncare) declaration that Model–M5 was demonstrated during the demonstration held on 18/10/2023 by their representative and also submitted the test report of Model M-5 and M30. Which clarifies that the demonstrated model was M-5

			<p><b>(ii) During the demonstration</b> the technical specification of demonstrated equipment namely <b>Ultrasound Machine (Portable)</b> by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd <b>matches</b> with the technical specification of Ultrasound Machine (Portable) Model–M5.</p>
<p>(ii) As per the tender specification s.n.8. Should have integrated display screen size at least 15”. But Model M5 having display screen 12 inch. To confirm the information, please see the USFDA certificate and attached brochure for the model M5.</p> <p>Hemant Surgical dared to trick the technical staff in order to qualify for the demo.</p>	<p>The firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd clarifies that:-</p> <p>(i) USFDA certificate of Zoncare M5 provided by the competitor’s clearly states that the USFDA certificate has been expired since 2020. Since the model M5 in the USFDA with the specifications mentioned had been upgraded by our principal company and they being a manufacturer of Ultrasound machines have changed the version of M5 machine with 15.6” display and 3 probe connectivity as per market requirement.</p> <p>Normally if you see with every manufacturer, the model name of the product remains the same and only the versions keep changing as per technology upgradation. However, looking at the tender terms and conditions floated by you for the Ultrasound machines, it clearly mentions that either USFDA or European CE any of the one will be accepted. However, we had already provided the European CE (Valid till 25<sup>th</sup> March 2024) of the said model so no questions arise of considering USFDA.</p> <p><b><u>(ii) Proof of Authenticity of our Products:</u></b></p> <p>we have successfully received order from Madhya Pradesh Public healthcare Service Corporation Limited for 147</p>	<p><b>Objection not valid due to following reasons:-</b></p> <p>(i) In the BMSICL tender, required Quality certificate for the equipment was USFDA or European CE (from notified body), against which the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd submitted the European CE certificate (from notified body). The USFDA certificate of Zoncare M5 has expired in 2020 and moreover the firm has not submitted the same in its tender.</p> <p>(ii) In the previous BMSICL Tender no. ME-285 for the equipment Ultrasound Machine (Portable) the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd quoted the same models i.e M5. In the above said tender the firm <b>M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd. and M/s Balajee Enterprises</b> also participated but they did not give any representation against the quoted model of Ultrasound Machine (Portable) by the firm M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.</p>	

		<p>units. The specifications floated by MPPHSCL is the same specifications of Model M5 as per tender floated by BMSICL for Ultrasound (Portable), where the respective authorities have evaluated the product, due diligence was been done and after all the evaluations the order was been placed to us which has been successfully supplied, installed and are working.</p> <p>(iii) The tender no. ME-285 had the same specifications and we had quoted the same models i.e M5 for which we were technically qualified by your technical committee and our commercials were also opened. This also states that our products are proven and technical verified.</p>	
--	--	---	--

6. After perusal of demonstration report and the clarification submitted by the firm namely M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd by the committee in today's meeting, the status of qualified/disqualified firms were found as following:-

Sl. No.	Name of Equipment	Name of Bidders	Remarks
1.	Ultrasound Machine (Portable)	M/s Balajee Enterprises	Technically Qualified
		M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.	Technically Qualified
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.	<b>Technically Disqualified</b>
		M/s Vikas Medical Devices	Technically Qualified
2	Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler	M/s Balajee Enterprises	Technically Qualified
		M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.	Technically Qualified
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.	Technically Qualified
		M/s Vikas Medical Devices	Technically Qualified
3	Computed Radiography (CR System)	M/s Fujifilm India Pvt. Ltd.	Technically Qualified
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.	Technically Qualified

7. It was therefore decided unanimously to open the financial bid of the equipment quoted by the following technically qualified bidders.

Sl. No.	Name of Equipment	Name of Bidders
1.	Ultrasound Machine (Portable)	M/s Balajee Enterprises
		M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.
		M/s Vikas Medical Devices
2	Ultrasound Machine with Color Doppler	M/s Balajee Enterprises
		M/s Hemant Surgical Industries Ltd.
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.
		M/s Vikas Medical Devices
3	Computed Radiography (CR System)	M/s Fujifilm India Pvt. Ltd.
		M/s Konica Minolta Healthcare India Pvt. Ltd.

The meeting thus concluded with a vote of thanks.

**Sd/-**  
**(Sh. Navindra Kumar)**  
DGM (Equipment),  
BMSICL

**Sd/-**  
**(Dr. Madhukar Dayal)**  
Assistant Professor  
NMCH Patna

**Sd/-**  
**(Dr. Umakant Prasad)**  
Additional Professor  
IGIMS Patna

**Sd/-**  
**(Sh. Mirtunjay Kumar)**  
A.O –Cum- Incharge,  
Procurement, SHSB

**Sd/-**  
**(Sh. Ravindra Kumar)**  
GM, Procurement  
BMSICL

**Sd/-**  
**(Sh. Najar Hussan)**  
CGM, Supply Chain  
BMSICL

**Sd/-**  
**(Sh. Sudhir kumar)**  
Joint secretary, Health Deptt.,  
G.O.B

**Sd/-**  
**(Dr. Sunil kumar Jha)**  
Director in Chief Health Deptt.,  
G.O.B